

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

PRESENT

Dr J Jaftha (Chairperson)	Department of Agriculture (DoA)
Dr G Bouwer	Chairperson of the Advisory Committee under GMO Act, 1997
Ms L Sello	Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT)
Mr A Pretorius	Department of Health (DoH)
Ms E Koekemoer	Department of Trade and Industry (the dti)
Ms E L Marshall (Secretariat)	Department of Agriculture

APOLOGIES

Mr B Durham	Department of Science and Technology (DST)
-------------	--

ABSENT

Mr L Motshelanoka	Department of Labour (DoL)
-------------------	----------------------------

IN ATTENDANCE

Ms W P Mandivenyi	Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism
Mr S Mokhothu	Department of Agriculture
Ms E Jantjies	Department of Agriculture
Ms MI Molepo	Department of Agriculture
Ms R Chanda	Department of Health
Ms S M G Zwane	Department of Science and Technology

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
1.	OPENING AND WELCOME	The Chairperson welcomed those present.	
2.	ATTENDANCE	The attendance register was circulated to everyone present for signature and	

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
	REGISTER AND APOLOGIES	an apology was registered for Mr B Durham.	
3.	ADDITIONS TO AND ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	The agenda was adopted with the addition of 8.1 Registrar and 10.1 Portfolio Committee for Environmental Affairs and Tourism: Public hearings on GMOs.	
4.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF 17 JULY 2007	The minutes of the meeting of 15 May 2007 were approved.	
5. 5.1	MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF 15 MAY 2007 Risk assessment of stacked plant biotechnology products and Ecological Risk Assessment (DEAT)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) The Council noted that following the last meeting a draft version of the ERA document was circulated to members of the Council for additional inputs or comments. However it has emerged that not all members received the document; DEAT undertook to ensure that all members receive the document. (ii) DEAT is in the process of commissioning a service provider to finalise the document by verifying scientific aspects in this guideline document. 	

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
5.2	Visit to Argentina to benchmark SA trade implications (DoA)	<p>(iii) The Council noted that all inputs have to be submitted to Ms W P Mandivenyi at DEAT by no later than 24 July 2007.</p> <p>(iv) The Council noted that DEAT may be in a position to provide the finalised document to the Advisory Committee for discussion at their meeting on 15 August 2007. Should this materialise, the Chairperson will invite a representative from DEAT via e-mail to attend the meeting of the Advisory Committee.</p> <p>(i) The Council noted that despite undertakings by people identified by the Agricultural Attaché in the USA and all protocol measures being adhered to, difficulties are still being experienced to finalise arrangements for the intended visit. The Council noted the call for patience and a call for a positive attitude despite significant delays in the intended visit.</p>	<p>Council</p> <p>DEAT & Chairperson</p> <p>Council</p>
5.3	Study by the dti (DoA)	<p>(i) The Council noted that the dti has prepared a submission to their Minister regarding the outcome of the study on the impact of commodity imports.</p> <p>(ii) The Council decided that the Office of the Registrar must liaise with the dti in order to brief the Minister of Agriculture and Land Affairs on progress with this matter.</p> <p>(iii) The Council decided that these briefing notes will be made available to other departments who may decide whether they would want to use it for briefing purposes of their principals.</p> <p>(iv) The Council noted that the industry indicated that they have prepared a contingency plan on the trade implications on GMOs</p>	<p>Act. Registrar and the dti</p> <p>Act. Registrar and the dti</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
5.4	17/3/1-WarrenChem-06/001: General release of malolactic wine yeast (ML01)	<p>which they will provide to the dti for inclusion in the drafting of an official position in this regard which in turn will guide the Council with decisions on commodity imports.</p> <p>(v) The Council noted other global developments such as Brazil's decision to produce GMO sugarcane.</p> <p>(i) The Council recalled that the Advisory Committee recommended this application for approval but that the Council had concerns and questions on the socio-economic impact, labelling and the International Organisation for Wine and Vine and reserved a decision.</p>	the dti & act. Registrar
5.5	17/3/1-WITS-07/019: Extension permit for trial release MRKAd5 HIV-1 vaccine	<p>(i) The Council recalled that the application was approved but that a question was asked on why an application for an extension was submitted when the initial trial had not yet started. The Office of the Registrar indicated that it was due to a problem with the importation of the vaccine.</p>	Act. Registrar
5.6	Feedback on appeals lodged under the GMO Act and other related legal matters (Biowatch court case)	<p>(i) The Council noted that judgement on the appeal of Biowatch against the cost order, which was heard in the High Court on 23 April 2007, is still awaited.</p> <p>(ii) The Council noted that an Appeal Board has been appointed to consider the appeal lodged by the CSIR (Contained use of GM sorghum) and the outcome is awaited.</p> <p>(iii) The Council noted that an Appeal Board has been appointed to consider the appeal lodged by the ARC (field trial application with</p>	Act. Registrar

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
6.	APPLICATIONS TO BE CONSIDERED BY EC	GM Cassava).	
6.1	ARC:OVI – 07/001: Contained use of Spunta (G2) [Dr du Plessis]	(i) The Council, in view of written consensus by departments and verbal confirmation by DST at the meeting, decided to approve the application ARC:OVI – 07/001: Contained use of Spunta (G2). (ii) The Council requested the Office of the Registrar to follow-up on the concern regarding the registration of the facility.	Act. Registrar
6.2	Biological Control Products – 07/001: Trial Release of G M Mosquitocide [Prof M McGeogh]	(i) The Council noted that although the members of the Review Committee recommended approval of this application, the Chairperson did not. (ii) The Council expressed the following concerns: the reasons why SA has been chosen for this trial as it is not the country in Africa most affected by mosquitoes, the containment of the organism, it is a listed activity and requires an EIA. (iii) The Council does not approve the application Biological Control Products – 07/001: Trial Release of G M Mosquitocide. (iv) The Council indicated that should the applicant apply for contained use, the concerns raised should be addressed. This however will not guarantee approval.	
6.3	Afriflowers – 07/001: Contained Use of GM flowers and bulbs [Dr B	(i) The Council noted that the Review Committee rejected this application on the grounds of insufficient information. (ii) The Council does not approve the application Afriflowers – 07/001:	

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
6.4	Westfall] Stellenbosch – 06/011: Field trials with GM Grapevine (GUS)[Mr S Cawe]	<p>Contained Use of GM flowers and bulbs. Should the applicant however decide to reapply, a completely new application will have to be submitted as the current one is deficient in a number of areas.</p> <p>(i) Some of the comments/inputs from Council members were:- The socio-economic concerns are not different to those of the malolactic wine yeast application. If approval was to be granted, the trial should be adequately isolated from other vines.</p> <p>(ii) The Council decided to, based on the information required, draft a list of questions to the applicant. The responses and the application should be referred back to the Advisory Committee for further comments.</p> <p>(iii) Decision: pending</p>	Act. Registrar
6.5	Triclinium – 07/009: Trial release of GM Measles Vaccine, MVA-mBN85B [Prof A Williamson]	<p>(i) The Council raised concerns on why SA has been chosen as the first trial site in the world as it has a rather low incidence if compared to the rest of Africa.</p> <p>(ii) The Council decision is pending the responses from the applicant. This will be conveyed officially via a letter from the act. Registrar to the Registrar of the MCC.</p>	Act. Registrar
7. 7.1	EXTENSION PERMITS Syngenta – 07/091: Extension permit for	<p>(i) The Council approved the application Syngenta – 07/091: Extension permit for import and trial release of maize event GA21.</p>	Act. Registrar

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
7.2	import and trial release of maize event GA21 D & PL -07/108: Extension permit for import trial release of cotton event BGIIxRRFlex and RRFlex	(i) No concerns were raised on this application. DoA requested the office of the Registrar to amend the application forms to provide for a question on why the extension is requested. (ii) The Council approved the application D & PL -07/108: Extension permit for import trial release of cotton event BGIIxRRFlex and RRFlex.	
8.	NEW MATTERS		
8.1	Registrar	(i) The Council decided that it has to go through an exercise to determine a standard operating procedure for both EC and AC which <i>inter alia</i> will also address this question.	Act. Registrar
9.	STANDING MATTERS	The Council noted permits issued since the last meeting.	
9.1	Copies of permits issued since last meeting	The Council noted the report on current trials.	
9.2	Report on current trials		

Deleted: ¶
The Council posed the question on whether it is legally acceptable for the act. Registrar to also serve as Chairperson of the Council.

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.25"

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
<p>10.</p> <p>10.1</p>	<p>GENERAL</p> <p>Portfolio Committee for Environmental Affairs and Tourism: Public hearings on GMOs</p>	<p>(i) The Council noted the report by DEAT that this year in the Budget Vote the issue of labelling of GMOs was mentioned and the Portfolio Committee has called for a public hearing on GMOs on 31 July 2007 in Parliament .</p> <p>(ii) The Council noted the request by DEAT for full representation by the Executive Council members at this hearing.</p> <p>(iii) The Council indicated that the request for members to attend should be addressed to them via e-mail and Ms W P Mandivenyi of DEAT should liaise with members and also provide them with the agenda as soon as DEAT is able to obtain it from the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee.</p> <p>The next meeting of the Executive Council is scheduled for 18 September 2007.</p>	<p>Act. Registrar</p> <p>DEAT</p>
<p>11.</p>	<p>DATE OF NEXT MEETING</p>	<p>The meeting was adjourned at 11:20.</p>	<p>Council</p>
<p>12.</p>	<p>CLOSURE</p>		

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
17 JULY 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

Approved by Chairperson

Dr J Jaftha
Name

.....
Signature

Date:

Approved by Registrar

Dr J. Jaftha
Name

.....
Signature

Date: