

**RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS
OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

PRESENT

Dr J Jaftha (Chairperson)
Ms L Sello
Mr A Pretorius
Ms E Koekemoer
Ms E L Marshall (Secretariat)

Department of Agriculture (DoA)
Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT)
Department of Health (DoH)
Department of Trade and Industry (**the dti**)
Department of Agriculture

APOLOGIES

Mr B Durham
Dr G Bouwer

Department of Science and Technology (DST)
Chairperson of the Advisory Committee under GMO Act, 1997

ABSENT

Mr L Motshelanoka

Department of Labour (DoL)

IN ATTENDANCE

Ms W P Mandivenyi
Mr M Masilela
Ms C Arendse
Ms E Jantjies
Ms I Molepo
Ms R Chanda
Ms R Ngoepe
Ms K C Malakalaka

Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism
Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism
Department of Agriculture
Department of Agriculture
Department of Agriculture
Department of Health
Department of Agriculture
Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
1.	OPENING AND WELCOME	The Chairperson welcomed those present and especially Ms C Arendse, the newly appointed Director: Bio-safety in the Department of Agriculture. The establishment of the new Directorate came about as a result of restructuring in	

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
		the DoA; the GMO Act is currently being administered in this new Directorate. Ms Arendse will be in attendance to ensure follow up processes on matters related to the functions of the Registrar.	
2.	ATTENDANCE REGISTER AND APOLOGIES	The attendance register was circulated to everyone present for signature and an apology were registered for Mr B Durham and Dr G Bower.	
3.	ADDITIONS TO AND ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	The agenda was adopted with the following additions:- 5.9 Report on the Portfolio Committee for Environmental Affairs and Tourism: Public hearings on GMOs. 8.1 Participation in Codex Task Force meeting 8.2 Liability and Redress Working Group meeting	
4.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF 17 JULY 2007	The minutes of the meeting of 17 July 2007 were approved.	
5.	MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF 17 JULY 2007		

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
5.1	Risk assessment of stacked plant biotechnology products and Ecological Risk Assessment (DEAT)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) The Council noted that the draft Ecological Risk Assessment (ERA) has not been finalised and that the new target date for the finalisation is 14 October 2007 after which it will be forwarded to the Advisory Committee (AC) members for comments. (ii) The Council noted that at the last meeting they indicated that they did not receive the draft document on which DEAT requested inputs and although it was distributed to EC members, no inputs were received by DEAT. (iii) The Council noted the proposal that the EC, AC and Service Provider should meet and discuss the draft document before the expiry on the Service Provider's contract on 14 October 2007. The next AC meeting (10 October 07) was proposed as a possible meeting time. (iv) The Council requested the Office of the Registrar to liaise with DEAT regarding the format of the document and finalization of the meeting (as noted above). 	Office of the Registrar
5.2	Visit to Argentina to benchmark SA trade implications (DoA)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) The Council noted that documents that need to be completed for the envisaged visit to Argentina have been circulated and that the challenge now will be to secure seats on the same flight from Soa Paulo to Buenos Aires. (ii) The Council noted that some of the members have been placed on the waiting list but that there are two scheduled flights one hour apart on 29 September 2007. (iii) The Council noted they must submit their allocation codes to the Chairperson for purposes of hotel reservations. (iv) The Council noted that they should prepare for the visit and take 	Executive Council

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
5.3	Study by the dti (DoA)	<p>relevant documents and information along.</p> <p>(v) The Council noted that there is some contradiction on the requirements regarding visas and that Ms E Koekemoer would after visiting the Department of Foreign Affairs, inform EC members via e-mail in this regard.</p> <p>(i) The Council noted the report by Ms E Koekemoer that the dti drafted a document regarding the outcome of the study on the impact of commodity imports which was discussed within their Chief Directorate during which the question on how other countries deal with this matter was raised. It was decided that an official clearance should be requested from the WTO desk of the dti.</p> <p>(ii) The Council awaits the outcome of the study.</p>	<p>the dti</p> <p>the dti</p>
5.4	17/3/1-WarrenChem-06/001: General release of malolactic wine yeast (ML01)	<p>(i) The Council noted the feedback by the dti that the Wine industry had discussed this matter not just in terms of the Export Council but also in terms of the General Council for the wine industry and that they are against a general release due to the massive consumer resistance against GMOs, especially from the wine drinking consumers.</p> <p>(ii) The Council noted that the major export market for the wine industry is the United Kingdom who is against GMOs and the local Wine industry indicated that the risk is just too high.</p> <p>(iii) The Council requested the dti to, in writing, indicate their position</p>	<p>the dti</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
		<p>regarding the application 17/3/1-Warren Chem-06/001: General release of malolactic wine yeast (ML01) and to submit a clear recommendation in this regard.</p> <p>(iv) The Council noted that the DoA had concluded their consultation. The International Organisation of Wine and Vine (OIV) is still developing a GMO policy which will set the guidelines and standards for the use of GMOs in wine production. As the European Union is currently the RSA's biggest export market for wines; the DoA does not recommend approval of the application.</p> <p>(v) The Council noted that DEAT indicated that they deduct that the international industry is not yet ready for a general release of malolactic wine yeast.</p> <p>(vi) The Council decided that the application 17/3/1-Warren Chem-06/001: General release of malolactic wine yeast (ML01) is denied.</p>	Office of the Registrar
5.5	Stellenbosch – 06/011: Field trials with GM Grapevine (GUS)	The Council noted that in line with the decision taken at their meeting of 17 July 2007, a list of questions was directed at the applicant but a response , which will, together with the application be referred back to the Advisory Committee for further comments, is still awaited .	Office of the Registrar
5.6	Triclinium – 07/009: Trial release of GM Measles Vaccine, MVA-mBN85B	<p>(i) The Council noted that their questions were deferred to the applicant and that the answers were forwarded to Council members of 6 August 2007.</p> <p>(ii) The Council noted individual responses as:-</p>	

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
5.9	Feedback on the Portfolio Committee for Environmental Affairs and Tourism: Public hearings on GMOs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) The Council noted the feedback from DEAT on the outcome of the hearings. As a result of the support and assistance from fellow council members, they were able to present a united front and the public hearings on GMOs went well. (ii) The Council noted that the Minister of Health took a personal interest in labelling and toxicological assessments. (iii) The Council noted that should it be determined that there is no health reason to label, then the consumer's right to information will be set as a reason and the dti will come into play. (iv) The Council noted that information on cost benefit studies undertaken in the Philippines and Australia is available but that the dti is proposing a cost benefit study for SA to TIPS. (v) The Council noted that DoA still has to respond to some questions raised during the hearing. 	<p>DoH</p> <p>the dti</p> <p>DoA</p>
6.			
6.1	<p>NEW APPLICATIONS TO BE CONSIDERED BY EC</p> <p>Monsanto – 07/363: General release of cotton (BGIIxRRFlex)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) During the discussion on the application Monsanto – 07/363: General release of cotton (BGIIxRRFlex) the responses were as follows:- 	

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Advisory Committee (Review Committee): Approved. ➤ DEAT: Approved but indicated that:- <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Where a new generation traits are approved, the old ones need to be withdrawn and the industries allowed time to submit proof to this end. ○ It was also indicated that the submission of annual reports on the performance of Bollgard Round-up Ready which was set as a condition, have not been submitted. ○ Post marketing information should not only be on maize. ➤ DoA: Approved but indicated that:- <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ It is strange that there is no public input on this application. ○ This is the first feeding study involving catfish as a model that the DoA is aware of. The applicant indicated that catfish were used to also assess water quality. ➤ the dti: Approved. ➤ DoH: Despite the application and reviewers report being e-mailed and faxed to DoH by DoA, the documents were not received and their recommendation is thus pending. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (ii) The Council noted that the Office of the Registrar will circulate the Annual Report received from Syngenta which includes the post marketing monitoring plan (not related to the Monsanto application but could inform the assessment of Monsanto's post marketing monitoring plan). Council members are required to indicate whether they are satisfied with the plan. (iii) The Council noted that the Office of the Registrar will engage with DEAT regarding the post marketing monitoring plan and request Monsanto to submit information regarding post marketing. 	<p>Office of the Registrar</p> <p>Office of the Registrar</p> <p>Office of the Registrar</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
7.	STANDING MATTERS	<p>(iv) The Council requested DoH to determine whether the feeding studies with catfish as model are acceptable.</p> <p>(v) The Council decided that a decision on Monsanto-07/363: General release of cotton (BGIIxRRFlex) is pending.</p>	
7.1	Copies of permits issued since last meeting	The Council noted permits issued since the last meeting.	
7.2	Report on current trials	The Council noted the report on current trials.	
9.	GENERAL		
9.1	Participation in Codex Task Force meeting	<p>(i) The Council noted that a representative of DoH will attend a Codex Task Force meeting set to take place on 27-28 September 2007 and that risk assessment in animals and plants will be discussed.</p> <p>(ii) The Council noted that DoA's future participation will be pursued by the newly appointed Director: Bio-safety.</p>	Director: Bio-safety, DoA
9.2	Liability and Redress	(i) The Council noted that the Working Group is nearing their conclusion in this regard and in an endeavour to have a decision ready for May 2008, the service provider appointed to compile the SA position, will contact some Council members to request commitment to participate in the Working Group meeting which is set	DEAT, Office of the Registrar and other

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL UNDER GMO ACT, 1997 HELD ON
18 SEPTEMBER 2007, HARVEST HOUSE, ROOM 332, PRETORIA**

NO.	SUBJECT	RESOLUTION	FOR ATTENTION
10.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	for the same date as the next Executive Council meeting. (ii) The Council noted that DEAT will send out invitations to this meeting scheduled for 23 October 2007 and that the impact on the Executive Council meeting will be communicated. The next meeting of the Executive Council is scheduled for 23 October 2007.	Council Members
11.	CLOSURE	The meeting was concluded at 11:00.	

Approved by Chairperson

Dr J Jaftha
Name

.....
Signature

Date:

Approved by Registrar

Dr J. Jaftha
Name

.....
Signature

Date: